A Political Ecology of Northwest Amazonia: Indigenous 'Management of the World' and the Politics of Territorial Ordering in Colombia



Oscar Alfredo Forero Larrañaga

A thesis submitted to the University of London in fulfilment of the requirements governing the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Imperial College University of London

December 2002

Declaration

I declare that this is my own work and has not been submitted in any previous application for a degree. The results presented here are from analyses that were carried out by myself, other contributions have been acknowledged.

Abstract of Thesis

This thesis provides a description of political conflicts derived from differences in perspectives of environmental management and governance for Northwest Amazonia (NWA). The methodology used is that of deconstruction of discourses, which are taken as constituents of reality.

There is a description of political conflicts involving indigenous organisations, religious institutions, conservation organisations, NGOs, the Colombian Government and a guerrilla group. It is suggested that conflict analysis promotes mutations in indigenous understanding of the world, all of which is reflected in the transformation of their environmental management practises.

A chapter is devoted to analysing the impact of State security policy in the development of indigenous' territorial rights. It is noticed that the Colombian and USA government discourses of security coincide in some relevant aspects. It is concluded that the derived policies increase environmental risks and hinder indigenous peoples' rights.

Survey forms are treated as an additional source of discourse and are used to illustrate different perspectives with respect to governance and territorial ordering in Amazonia. It is argued that inhabitants of the industrialised countries with access to Information and Communication Technology (ICT) in many senses share the responsibility for the actual state of affairs in NWA, as well as other parts of the developing world where there is precarious access to ICT. However, as access to ICT is highly restricted in the majority of the developing world, how might we attempt a 'social contract' at the global scale? By asking such questions of the reader, the author calls into question the validity of the concept of 'civil society'.

Central to the thesis is the idea that we are passing through a moment of conceptual 'dissolution': dissolution of the divide 'Indigenous Knowledge' / 'Western Sciences', of the distinction between 'Social Resistance' and 'Social Adaptation', and of the differentiation between 'Corporate Management' and 'State Security policy'. The thesis describes how this dissolution is occurring at the same time as cultural identity is mutating. The thesis goes beyond discourses surrounding the governance of NWA, by offering a contemporary critique of the concept of 'globalisation', and an attempt to locate it in the a 21st century cultural context.

Acknowledgements

There are organisations and people without which this research work would never have happened. Dr. E.J. Milner-Gulland, former Lecturer at the University of Warwick (where I meet her) and now Lecturer at Imperial College (IC) met Dr. Graham Woodgate during the first informal conversations about the merger of Wye College and IC. Graham was coordinating the Wye Environmental Sociology Research Group (WESRG), and E.J. mentioned to him some of the similarities between my research work and that of the WESRG. I subsequently paid a visit to Wye and made a presentation to the Research Group. It was very exiting to find out that people working in Cameroon, Chile, Mexico and U.K were finding out similar 'social movement' responses to the 'globalisation process'. Without E.J.'s and Graham's enthusiastic support I would not have attempted to pursue a PhD at IC.

To fund my stay in the UK, I was awarded a scholarship-loan by the Colombian organisation Colfuturo; and I won a Chevening Scholarship from the British Council and an Overseas Research Student scholarship from the Council of Vice-Chancellors and Principals of the UK Universities. Without these organisations' support, it would not have been possible for me to remain in the UK and continue with my research.

In 1999 the External Programme (IC at Wye) hired me to do on-line tutoring for courses in Environmental Management and Environmental Sciences. I am especially thankful to Dr. Richard Pearce and to the students of these courses. The development of online fora forced me to re-think how environmental ethics are formed, all of which is narrated in one of the chapters of this dissertation.

All the people that run Wye Campus (IC) have been extremely helpful, but I want to thank especially Julie Fletcher and Pauline Taylor from the Academic Office. I am also grateful to Dr. Remi Gauthier and Dr. Roger Price for giving me the opportunity to join the team of Subwardens at Wye, which has been a valuable experience and made a useful contribution to my subsistence.

SLAS (Society for Latin American Studies) funded visits to conferences and workshops on three different occasions. From SLAS I want to thank especially Victoria Carpenter. The Center for Comparative Research, Yale University also funded my participation in their Conservation and Sustainable Development workshop. The Department of History of Columbia University funded my participation in their Conference on Activism as History, History of Activism. From participation in these workshops and conferences several chapters of this dissertation took form or were reshaped, as is acknowledged at

the beginning of each of those chapters. I want to thank these organisations and the participants in the named events.

I am also thankful to the British Airways Conservation Programme for funding a trip to Colombia in 1999 and to the Natural Resources International Foundation that awarded a fieldwork scholarship that allowed me to visit Northwest Amazonia in the summer of 2002.

In London I have always found shelter with Zulema, she has been a dedicated companion, hearing me during the inevitable crises one faces when elaborating a PhD dissertation. Zulema and my parents have encouraged me to keep going in the most difficult moments and I will be grateful to them always.

From Colombia I received help of numerous people. Special thanks to Adriana Rico from Paginas Net for useful advise in Web-site design, to the board of Puerto Rastrojo for allowing me to use their vegetation map, to Dr. Carlos Rodriguez and Dr. Clara van der Hammen from Tropenbos Colombia and Dr. Martín von Hildebrand from COAMA for the interviews conceded.

Other people to whom I am grateful for their support are Henry Salazar (Planeación Nacional – Ministry of Environment), Klaus Schutzen (Ministry of Environment), Adriana Lagos (Planeación Nacional), Patricia Falla (Departamento Administrativo del Medio Ambiente). In Leticia, Ramon Laborde (Instituto Colombiano de Bienestar Familiar), Mauricio Díaz (Fundación Hylea) and all the team of the GAIA Foundation working there. Fieldwork would not have been possible without the help of Gladys Angulo. And, once in the field, Carlos Franky (Universidad Nacional), Dany Mahecha (GAIA Foundation) and Luis A. Trujillo facilitated my work greatly. Thank you to them all.

Since our first conversation until now, Dr Graham Woodgate has encouraged me to persevere, he has criticised my work providing useful insights that allowed me to develop my research skills. I am in debt to Graham for his help and advice.

There are numerous other people that have read and criticised different chapters of this dissertation, that have provided information or that have encouraged me to keep going, I thank them all. I am especially thankful to the respondents of the on-line questionnaire of www.kumoro.com. And last, but most certainly not least, this an occasion to thank the indigenous peoples of the Yaigojé Resguardo, the world they have opened to me is rich and vast and I know I will never stop learning from it.

To my Parents

Abbreviations

ACAIPI: Asociación de Capitanes Indígenas del Pirá-Paraná (Association of Traditional Authorities from the Pirá-Paraná Resguardo Indigenous Reserve).

ACIMA: *Asociación de Capitanes Indígenas del Mirití – Amazonas* (Association of Traditional Authorities from the Mirití Resguardo Indigenous Reserve – Amazon).

ACITAM: Asociación de Capitanes Indígenas del Trapecio Amazónico (Association of Traditional Authorities from the Colombian Amazon).

ACIYA: Asociación de Capitanes Indígenas del Yaigojé y el Río Apaporis (Association of Traditional Authorities from the Yaigojé Resguardo Indigenous Reserve and the Apaporis River).

AUC: Autodefensas Unidas de Colombia (United self-defence of Colombia) the association of Colombian para-militars.

CANOA: Coordinación y Alianza para el Norte y el Oeste Amazónico (Alliance and Coordination for Northwest Amazonia). CANOA associates NGO networks from Brazil, Colombia, Venezuela and the Andean Countries.

CAP: Corporación Autónoma del Putumayo (Putumayo Autonomous Corporation).

CEPAL: Comisión Económica para América Latina (Economics Commission for Latin America).

CIC: Conservación Internacional – Colombia (Conservation International – Colombia).

COAMA: *Consolidación de la Amazonía*, (Consolidation for Amazonia) the largest NGOs' Network operating in the Colombian Amazon.

COICA: Coordinadora de Organizaciones Indígenas de la Cuenca Amazónica (Coordination for Indigenous Organisations from the Amazon Basin).

CRIVA: *Consejo Regional Indígena del Vaupés* (Indigenous Regional Council from Vaupés – Colombia).

DANIDA: Danish Agency for Developmental Assistance

ELN: *Ejercito de Liberación Nacional* (National Liberation Army).

EU: European Union

FAO: Food & Agriculture Organisation

FAP: Foro Ambiental Permanente (Permanent Environmental Management Forum).

FARC: Fuerzas Armadas Revolucionarias de Colombia (Revolutionary Armed Forces of Colombia).

GATT: The General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade

GNP: Gross National Product

IBRD: International Bank for Reconstruction and Development

ILO: International Labour Organisation

IMF: International Monetary Found

INCORA: Instituto Colombiano de la Reforma Agraria (Colombian Institute for the

Agrarian Reforms).

IUCN: International Union for the Conservation of Nature

NGOs: Non Governmental Organisations

NWA: Northwest Amazon

OEA: Organización de Estados Americanos (OAS – Organisation of American States).

PAR: Participatory Action Research

UN: United Nations

UAESPNN: Unidad Administrativa Especial del Sistema de Paques Nacionales

Naturales (Special Administrative Unit for the System of National Natural Parks).

WTO: World Trade Organisation

WWF: World Wide Fund for Nature